RAJYA SABHA

Friday 10th December, 1993/19th Agrahayana 1915 (Saka)

The House met at eleven of the clock, The Deputy Chairman in the Chair.

ORAL ANSWERS TO QUESTIONS

*121 [*The questioners (Dr. Bapu Kaldate and Shrimati Kamla Sinha) were absent, For Answer Vide Col..... infra*]

*122. [*The questioner (Dr. Sanjaya Sinh) was absent. For answer vide col .....infra*]

*123. [*The questioner (Dr. Yelamanchili Sivaji) was absent. For answer vide col. .....infra*]

Completion of Sardar Sarover Project Dam in Gujarat

*124. SHRI G. G. SWELL:†
SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY:

Will the Minister of WATER RESOURCES be pleased to state:

(a) by when the waters of Narmada would start flowing to the main canal in Gujarat;

(b) what is the estimated cost to complete the remaining portion of the Sardar Sarovar Project dam:

(c) what is the level of the height of the Project so far completed with construction cost and residual height;

(d) what is the cost of the construction of the main canal and what is the amount spent to cover the already constructed area stating the break up of lands acquired, digging and cement lining;

(e) whether it is a fact that only three villages are going to be completely submerged out of the total 248 villages partially affected;

(f) the details of villages that are going to be submerged and those partially affected separately;

(g) what is the number of farmers going to be affected in the concerned three states; and

(h) whether it is also a fact that for every 100 acres going to be irrigated by Sardar Sarovar Project only 1.65 acres are submerged?

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF URBAN DEVELOPMENT AND THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF WATER RESOURCES (SHRI P. K. THUNGON): (a) to (h) A Statement is laid on the Table of the House.

Statement

(a) Narmada Water is expected to start flowing in the main canal by 1995.

(b) Out of the total estimated cost of Rs. 6506.04 crores (a) 1986-87 price level), an expenditure of Rs. 2649.27 crores has been incurred ill the end of September, 1993.

(c) The minimum height of the block of the Sardar Sarovar Dam completed so far is about 41 metres above the mean river bed level. An expenditure of Rs 806.34 crores has been incurred on the dam and appurtenent work till the end of September, 1993. The residual height of the dam to be constructed is 87.5 metres above the block at minimum level.

(d) The total estimated cost at 1986-87 price level for the construction of Narmada main canal under the Sardar Sarovar project is Rs. 1588.54 crores. Out of this an amount of Rs. 886.20 crores has been spent till the end of October, 1993 which includes; Rs. 24.71 crores for acquiring of land, Rs. 185.02 crores for digging (earthwork) and Rs. 140.23 crores for cement lining (canal lining).

(e) and (f) Out of 248 villages affected by the Project only 3 villages are

†The Question was actually asked on the floor of the House by Shri G. G. Swell.

going to be completely submerged. Of the remaining 245 partially affected villages, 16 are in Gujarat, 36 in Maharashtra and 193 in Madhya Pradesh.

(g) A total of 12898 farmers (1437 in Gujarat, 1476 in Maharashtra and 9985 in Madhya Pradesh) are going to be affected due to submergence.

(h) For every 100 acres of land going to be irrigated by Sardar Sarovar Project, about 2 acres of land will be submerged by the reservoir.

SHRI G. G. SWELL: Madam, it is my misfortune that an important question like this is being answered by a junior Minister.

SHRIMATI JARANTHI NATARAJAN: What is this, Madam?

SHRI G. G. SWELL: I am saying this, Madam, because it is a very serious question. (*Interruptions*).

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARANJAN: It is not correct. It is very bad.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Actually this matter on Narmada was raised in the House and the Minister, Mr. Shukla, had handled it himself and explained every query in a great detail.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: Madam, he only said, "Junior Minister". It is not derogatory.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am not saying it derogatory.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: He means, the Minister of State is a junior Minister. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI G. G. SWELL: She knows my mind better than what I know.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now let us go ahead.

SHRI G. G. SWELL: I would like answers and clarifications to the following:

(a) When are you going to close the sluice gate of the Dam?

(b) Have you got a clearance from the Ministry of Environment for the closing of the Dam?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I suppose, you should ask one supplementary. I will give you another chance.

SHRI G. G. SWELL: Madam, even in the written answers they give answers as (a), (b), (c) & (d). I put these questions to penetrate this Minister, which is very difficult. Part (c) of my question is: Has the ecological effect of the downstream been studied? If so, what are the details thereof?

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: It is a tribal warfare. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI G. G. SWELL: I am an Indian. If I fight, I will fight with a *Brahmin* like you. Part (d) of my question is: does the Narmada Water Disputes Tribunal Award specifically enjoin that the rehabilitation of the oustees would be completed one year before the lands are submerged?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let him answer. You had been in the Chair before. You know how the House should run.

SHRI G. G. SWELL: I would also like to know whether on the 18th of November some policemen went to the Chinsekhedi village in Dhule district of Maharashtra and committed atrocities. After you close the sluice gate, by what time will the land get submerged? Do you have a record of the land-holders and the payments that you have to make to them? I hope I have made myself very clear. I have spoken in very simple English which I normally do not.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You have definitely spoken in very good English and you have made yourself very clear.

SHRI G. G. SWELL: I have spoken simple English...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Unfor-

tunately, you have put too many questions together. Even I have forgotten what you asked.

बोलिये मंत्री जी।

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: Such incredible arrogance...

SHRI G. G. SWELL: These people think by their numbers they can overpower me. They can never do that.

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: In arrogance we cannot overpower you...

SHRI P. K. THUNGON: Madam, I would like to submit to the hon. Member that we are not arrogant. Whatever questions the hon. Member had asked, we have replied. In addition to that, I will reply to his supplementaries. There were 5 or 6 supplementaries. He asked about the closing of the sluice gate of the dam. I would like to state that we have certain targets, as is normally the case with each and every projects. According to that target, we expect to complete the dam and the appurtenent work in 1998. About supplementary 'b' regarding environmental clearance etc., I would like to say, 'yes, the environment question has been cleared.' The environmental clearence was obtained in 1987. About supplementary 'c', regarding the ecological system and whether we had studied the downstream of the dam—the hon. Member is very senior and is very well informed—I would say, such projects are always thoroughly studied before the project is cleared. For the information of the hon. Member, I would like to tell him, that the story of Narmada Dam started as long back as 1954 when Pandit Jawaharlal Nehru laid the foundation stone there. In '50s and '60s through invstigations were carried out. After that, in '70s and early '80s, the adjudication and the project model was studied and after that the project was cleared. The project was cleared after proper examinations were made by the appraisal committees at the State level and at the Centre in the Ministry of Water Resources. It was deliberated upon in the review committee and after that it was studied and cleared by the Planning Commission. So it has come through, after thorough filtering.

Therefore, the ecological aspect and the downstream aspect have been well taken care of. About the award, regarding rehabilitation and resettlement, I would simply like to say, 'yes'. Madam, about atrocities...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: In Dhule District of Maharashtra.

SHRI P. K. THUNGON: This concerns your State.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, I remembered it; at least the last point I remembered.

SHRI P. K. THUNGON: As regards atrocities which the hon. Member has mentioned, I would like to state humbly again that no atrocities were committed. Whatever had to be done in the interests of the people of that area and in the interests of the country, these duties were carried out there and beyond that. We are not committing any atrocities.

SHRI G. G. SWELL: Madam, he has said that in closing the Sluice Gate of the dam, they have a target. And, according to his own statement, this should be done in 1988. It is on record...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Which record?

SHRI G. G. SWELL: In his statement.

SHRI P. K. THUNGON: It is 1998.

SHRI G. G. SWELL: I am sorry, I accept that they will close the dam only in 1998. Let that be on record and let there be no deviation from this... (*Interruptions*).

An Hon. MEMBER: It is already on record.

SHRI G. G. SWELL: Now he has answered it. Another question, Madam, is whether the Narmada Water Disputes

Tribunal Award specified that the oustees, who would be mostly tribals, should be rehabilitated one year before the closing of the Sluice Gate and the lands were submergd. He has not answered that...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I think, I remember because I was in the Chair when the Minister answered on this subject when we had a discussion on it, he answered on these queries.

SHRI G. G. SWELL: Now, Madam, my second suppementary...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let him answer this.

SHRI G. G. SWELL: No, my second supplementary; I am only taking up from what he promised...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: So, you ask one question, then he can answer.

SHRI G. G. SWELL: My second supplementary is, is it a fact that on the 18th of November, 1993, the so-called surveyors, to find out the holding of lands by different groups and different individuals, went with a force of 500 policement to Chinsekhedi village in Dhule district and that they shot dead a tribal young man, a 15 year old, by the name of Rama Puria Vasawa and another woman? And is it true that a team of human right activities visited this district? They have produced a report. They have held a Press Conference and have said that this thing had happned. They have demanded a judicial enquiry into the matter...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mantriji. ...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI G. G. SWELL: Now, why did they have to go with 500 policemen, armed policemen?

उपसभापति : मंत्री जी, जवाब दीजिए ।

SHRI G. G. SWELL: Why did they fire on these people? Yet, he says that there were no atrocities...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let him answer. I am not permitting half a dozen questions.

बोलिए मंत्री जी ।

SHRI G. G. SWELL: The whole thing was pre-planned in order to terrorize the villagers.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mantriji, I think you are also a tribal. Aren't you?

SHRI P. K. THUNGON: For your information, Madam, I am also a tribal and it is a tribal replying to another tribal.

THE MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE (SHRI BALRAM JAKHAR): Who is not a tribal?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: All of us are.

SHRI P. K. THUNGON: I think I have answered most of the questions, Madam. About R. R. problems, that is, resettlement and rehabilitation problems, it is very clearly stated in the Narmada Water Dispute Tribunal that until and unless the R. R. problems are solved, the dam should not be filled with water. So, that part I have made clear earlier and am making clear now also. That is why in answer to part (d) of the supplementary question, I have said, "yes".

About the problem of law and order, this is connected with the RR problem because we have got all sympathy for those who have to be evacuated in the greater interest of the fulfilment of the objectives. We have to see that justice is done to each and every displaced person. Actually, the number of displaced persons at the time of submitting the report to the Narmada Water Dispute Tribunal is now different because—the number has changed and goes on changing—the persons of 10 years age at that time became 18 years. They are now majors. Major persons have to be provided rehabilitation...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI G. G. SWELL: I asked a specific question...(*Interruption*)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: He is answering. He has not finished. Let him answer. Have patience just as he has to hear your question.

SHRI P. K. THUNGON: Therefore, a survey, rather a re-survey, was required to be conducted to know as to how many displaced persons could be there. That is why this survey team was sent there in the month of October. Then there was stiff resistance from the local people. The team could not proceed further. Therefore, it was decided that they should be sent there with police protection the following month. They were accordingly sent with police protection When they started doing the survey, a lot of disturbance took place and the local people started resisting the team by stone-pelting in other unlawful ways. In the team that the Government had sent, there were lady constables also. A few lady constables, besides some men constables, were injured because of stone-pelting. In self-defence, the police had fired one buller hit a boy. They fired just to scare them away. Unfortunately, the boy died and aonther was injured.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: It is over. ..ow, Shri Subramanian Swamy.. *(Interruption)*...

SHRI G. G. SWELL: It is his version. It is not the version of the tribals.

SHRI P. K. THUNGON: May I elucidate this a little bit more, Madam? After this incident, Ms. Medha Patkar filed a writ petition in the Court. The writ petition was rejected. There was also another writ petition filed by another party in the Gujarat High Court. The Court is now seized of the matter. That was, of course, about an NBA problem.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: Madam, Deputy Chairman, the Minister in his reply has given outdated figures. Therefore, my supplementary is to know as to what the current estimate is. He has given the cost estimate at the 1986-87 price level. So, I would like to know from the Minister the current cost of the project; how he is going to raise the finances for it; whether he is proposing to invite NRIs to buy bonds or is planning some other method. There is nothing in this reply which explains how the money is going to be raised for the project.

SHRI P. K. THUNGON: Madam, the hon. Member has raised a very pertinent question. This project cost which has been projected was at the price of level of 1986-87. After going through the progress of the project, we had decided that it was time to revise the cost escalation. There was a review meeting in August this year. And after that, the State Government of Gujarat has been asked to submit the revised estimate because that has to be done in consultation with the Chief Ministers of the other concerned States also. So, the revised estimate with respect to 1986-87 level and today is yet to be submitted by the Gujarat Government. And after that, we will be able to supply to the hon. Member the exact...

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: I did not ask this question of cost escalation, inefficiency and all that. I asked, what is the current value of the project? It is a very simple matter of using the price index to find out.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Do you have the current value of the project?

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: And how is it going to be financed?

SHRI P. K. THUNGON: It is under calculation. It is under process to work out as to what would be the figure. It is not so easy as the hon. Member has depicted. And about the second supplementary of the hon. Member, I am happy that the has put this question. The Gujarat Government has submitted a proposal to create a joint venture company to take care of the power project of the Narmada Project. And the proposal is that there should be shareholding of particularly three States, that is, Gujarat, Maharashtra and Madhya Pra-

desh. And also, in that, the private participation can take place. This is proposal one. And proposal two, the alternative, is that we may create a kind of private company, and through that it may be funded. These are the processes going on. It is being again discussed amongst the various States. It has to be finalised and has to come to the Review Committee. Then we will decide.

उपसभापति : श्री राम नरेश यादव। वैसे अभी सवाल का तो उन्होंने विस्तार से जवाब दे दिया है, इसमें कुछ रहा नहीं है। आगे सवालात बहुत हैं।

श्री राम नरेश यादव : माननीया, मैं तो आपके निर्देश के आधार पर ही पूछूंगा।

उपसभापति : ठीक है, चलिए, रिपिटेशन न हो क्वैश्चन का।

श्री राम नरेश यादव : महोदया, माननीय मंत्री जी ने जो अपने उत्तर में कहा है कि 248 गांव इससे प्रभावित हुए हैं, यह तीनों स्टेट से संबंधित मामला है और उत्तर में यह भी आया है कि 12,898 किसान इससे प्रभावित होने हैं। माननीया, मैं समझता हूं, जब इसकी निर्माण योजना पूरी हो जाएगी तो इसका बहुत बड़ा योगदान देश को होगा। इसी बात को ध्यान में रखते हुए मैं पूछना चाहूंगा कि जो किसान इससे प्रभावित हैं, उनमें से अब तक कितने किसानों को पुनर्स्थापित कर दिया गया है और कितने बाकी रह गए हैं? साथ ही, जो आपने इसमें बताया है 6,406 करोड़ रुपए का, उसमें से कितने करोड़ रुपए पुनर्व्यवस्था पर खर्च करने की व्यवस्था की है? यह मैं जानना चाहता हूं।

श्री पी. के. थुंगन : मैडम, अब तक पुनर्स्थापित करने के लिए हमने जितना खर्च किया है, वह मैं आपको बता दूंगा। आनरेबल मेम्बर को बता दूंगा, because I have to work it out and supply it. And the other figure which the hon. Member has asked...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You work it out and give it to him.

SHRI P. K. THUNGON: ...is about population. There also, without taking the time of the House...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You work it out and give it to him.

SHRI DINESHBHAI TRIVEDI: We are glad that finally 1995 will see the light of day as far as the Narmada Project is concerned. It is good that the Central Government, with the help of the three States involved, including Gujarat, and with the co-operation of all, is going to achieve its objective. I would like to know from the hon. Minister whether the water of Narmada would reach the Kutch and Saurashtra regions, particularly the Kutch region which is reeling under drought even today. Would the water of Narmada reach these regions? If 'yes' by when and in what quantity?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Calculate and find out.

SHRI P. K. THUNGON: As per the project report, in regard to drinking water for Kutch, the Narmada water would reach after the completion of the project.

SHRI DINESHBHAI THIVEDI: BY when? Would it be in 1995?

AN HON. MEMBER: 1998.

SHRI CHIMANBHAI MEHTA: Madam, I come from Gujarat. Please permit me.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I know you are from Gujarat. Mr. Trivedi is also from Gujarat. I thought he is also from Gujarat.

SHRI P. K. THUNGON: Madam, unless the canal is completed, water cannot reach there. The canal work is in progress. As per the projections...

SHRI N. E. BALARAM: He is not asking you to bring the water to the plains. He is asking about the time.

SHRI P. K. THUNGON: I am trying to say when it is going to be.

The water has to flow through the canal. Therefore, I am going through the canal.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please flow faster before the Question Hour is over.

SHRI DINESHBHAI TRIVEDI: What is the projected date?

SHRI P. K. THUNGON: According to the projections, by 2004, the canal work would be completed and then the water would reach.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Shri Chimanbhai Mehta.

SHRI DINESHBHAI TRIVEDI: In what quantity? The Minister has not answered this question. You must have made some projections. You must have calculated. I say this because there is some kind of an apprehension in the minds of the people that the Narmada water is not going to reach Kutch. Therefore, this point should be clarified.

SHRI P. K. THUNGON: So far as the quality of drinking water is concerned, it has to be decided through discussions amongst the States and the Review Committee. It would not be correct on my part to give any wrong figure. The exact figure I can furnish to the hon. Member.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Shri Chimanbhai Mehta, Please ask a very brief question.

SHRI CHIMANBHAI MEHTA: Thank you very much, Madam. There is a scarcity of drinking water in Kutch and Saurashtra. The problem has become very acute. Only 5 per cent of the 19 dams in Kutch are having water. In the case of Saurashtra, only 30 per cent of the dams-out of 85 dams-are having water. Therefore, water meant for irrigation is being reserved for drinking water purposes. In all the cities of Saurashtra, water is supplied only for twenty minutes per day. The condition in the villages is extremely bad.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: What is your question?

SHRI CHIMANBHAI MEHTA: In such a situation, I want that the Central Government should direct the Gujarat Government to see that they build the main canal because the main canal would take the water to Kutch and Saurashtra. In between, they should not start supplying water to the distributaries which is going to cost 55 per cent of the total expenditure. Therefore, they should not divert the money for the distributaries because it is meant for irrigation purposes. It should be mainly directed for drinking water purposes. This is the basic human need. One-and-a half crore people in Kutch and Saurashtra are living without water. Drinking water is a major problem in the villages. The agriculturists are also suffering. The agriculturists of Kutch and Saurashtra should be relived of their suffering. If they complete the canal, water would reach the cities of Saurashtra and Kutch as well as the rural areas.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please put your question.

SHRI CHIMANBHAI MEHTA: I am putting a specific question. Would the Central Government direct the Gujarat Government that they should concentrate on building the main canal to Kutch and they can take up the distributaries, which are 75000 kms. in length, afterwards? Would such a specific direction be given by the Central Government to the Gujarat Government?

SHRI P. K. THUNGON: Madam, it is a suggestion for action by Gujarat Government.

SHRI CHIMANBHAI MEHTA: It is not a suggestion. I am asking about the policy statement.

श्रीमती उर्मिला बेन चिमन भाई पटेल : उपसभापति महोदया, मैं यह पूछना चाहती हूं कि जब वर्ल्ड बैंक से केन्द्रीय सरकार ने विदड्रा करने का डिसीजन लिया प्रोजेक्ट पूरा करने के लिए तो गुजरात गवर्नमेंट को जो ग्रांट वर्ल्ड बैंक दे रहा था वह ग्रांट केन्द्रीय सरकार देगी ऐसा प्रोमिज किया था तो उसकी फर्स्ट इन्स्टालमेंट कब दे रहे हैं? अगर पैसा नहीं आयेगा तो प्रोजेक्ट आगे चलने वाला नहीं है। यह कब रिलीज करेंगे? कितने साल और कितने महीने में यह पूरा दे देंगे यह मंत्री महोदय जवाब दें। दूसरी बात यह है अगर

सौराष्ट्र कच्छ कैनाल का काम भी शुरू करना है तो इसके लिए पैसा चाहिए तो केन्द्रीय सरकार हमें कब मदद दे रही है? इन दोनों का अगर मंत्री महोदय जवाब दे दें तो गुजरात को तो फायदा होगा ही साथ ही तीनों राज्यों को भी फायदा होगा ।

SHRI P. K. THUNGON: Madam, I would like to explain a litte bit about the World Bank loan.

THE DEPUTR CHAIRMAN: No, no that is over. You answer her question. Did you follow? She said that the Government refused the World Bank loan. Now the money which was coming to Gujarat through World Bank is not coming. Is the Central Government going to give or not? Just say 'yes' or 'no' because we have taken half an hour on your Question. I cannot go more. I have other questions also.

SHRI P. K. THUNGON: I will try to be very brief and complete within a few minutes.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: It is a show of English. (Interruptions).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You do not know the reference to the context.

SHRI P. K. THUNGON: As I have said, the joint venture is conceived only because of this aspect. (Interruptions).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: It is for the Chair to take note of it.

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: What is he saying of 'show of English'? I protest against this. What is this?

उपसभापति : आप बैठ जाइये ।

SHRI P. K. THUNGON: That is how we have conceived this joint venture. We will take care when it comes up. Otherwise, we will try to work out other alternatives.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Next Question

*125. (The Questioner (Shri Debabrata Biswas) was absent. For answer vide col.. infra)

*126. (The Questioner (Shri Mohammed Afzal alias Meem Afzal) was absent. For answer vide col.....infra.)

बिहार में बड़ी सिंचाई परियोजनायें

*127. **श्री ब्रह्म देव आनन्द पासवान** : क्या जल संसाधन मंत्री यह बताने की कृपा करेंगे कि :

(क) बिहार के छोटा नागपुर क्षेत्र में बड़ी सिंचाई परियोजनाओं को लागू करने का क्या औचित्य है ;

(ख) विश्व बैंक द्वारा इस क्षेत्र में अभी तक कितनी बड़ी परियोजनाओं को स्वीकृति प्रदान की गई है; और

(ग) इस क्षेत्र में बड़ी सिंचाई परियोजनाओं का विकल्प क्या है और क्या सरकार वैकल्पिक व्यवस्था को प्रयोगिक आधार पर लागू करने का विचार रखती है ?

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF URBAN DEVELOPMENT AND THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF WATER RESOURCES (SHRI P. K. THUNGON): (a) to (c) Irrigation schemes are selected after taking into consideration site conditions, water availability, techno-economic, environmental and social factors. Keeping in view location specific constraints of the region, the State Govt. has laid more emphasis on medium and minor schemes in Chotta Nagpur area. Only one major project namely Subernarekha Multipurpose Project has been extended World Bank Credit assistance of US $127 million.

श्री ब्रह्मदेव आनन्द पासवान : बिहार के छोटा नागपुर के पलामू जिला में स्थित "कुटकू मंडल" बांध के निर्माण के मामले में पर्यावरण की दृष्टि से क्या आठ शर्तों